
BOOK NOTES

Peirce's account of meaning, Legg continues, may be distinguished into an explication of the meaning a concept has *for us*, which consists of the *expectations* that hypotheses containing that concept would lead us to form; and the meaning it has *simpliciter*, which consists of the *development* the concept undergoes over time and across the community of inquiry, and which often goes beyond our expectations. Both dimensions of meaning are shown to depend on Peirce's concept of continuity. Interesting parallels are drawn between Peirce's discussion of thirdness and firstness and Wittgenstein's discussion of rule-following. The latter has been mistakenly interpreted by Kripke as a radical new form of *skepticism*. Peirce's communitarian explication of meaning, truth, and reality is distinguished from Kripke's "skeptical" solution to the rule-following problem, and from various 'neo-pragmatisms.'

Because of the three categories, Peirce's realism swims against the tide of analytic philosophy, where a commitment to a univocal concept of being, most notably by Quine, has been most influential. The latter approach, Legg argues, encourages a tendency to reification to solve philosophical problems. In contrast, Peirce's three categories enable a triadic, processual analysis of signification, which, unlike the more usual dyadic framework of word and object, builds the interpretation (and development) of signs into the representation itself, and thereby into realism.

Theories of the Sign in Classical Antiquity

Giovanni Manetti, trans. by Christine Richardson
Indiana University Press, 1993, xvi + 196 pp.
ISBN 0-253-33684-8 (cloth), \$35.00

This English translation of Manetti's 1987 book presents a fascinating work on the pre-classical and classical origins of semiotic theory, beginning with a study of Mesopotamian and Greek divination; continuing with an investigation into Plato, Aristotle, Stoic philosophy, Epicurus, Philodemus, Cornificius, Cicero, and Quintillian; and finishing with a subtle reading of Augustine. Manetti makes con-

siderable use of the semiotic triangle (a triple dyadic construction with attributes different from Peirce's semiotic triad) as a grid of structural analysis, and one may wish his approach had been more genuinely triadic to see whether this could have modified the nuances of some conclusions. But in any case the book is extremely informative and insightful about the history of semiotics, and brings to light the development of semiotic concepts, which in itself is tantamount to retracing the steps of our logical evolution.

Reason, Experience, and God: John E. Smith in Dialogue

Vincent M. Colapietro (ed.)
Fordham University Press, 1997, 158 pp.
ISBN 0-8232-1706-x (cloth), \$28.00
ISBN 0-8232-1707-8 (paper), \$18.00

As an homage to a great contemporary American philosopher, this book fulfills its role admirably, with four searching and questioning papers by four solid thinkers—the late Vincent Potter; Robert J. Roth, S.J.; Vincent Colapietro; and Robert Neville—and with four considerate responses by John Smith. Potter emphasizes Smith's attempt to "recover experience" in the sense of saving that concept from its recent reductionistic past, and questions him about the nature of "religious experience," the distinction between immediate and direct experience of God, and his criticisms of ontological and cosmological arguments for God. Roth captures much of the essence of Smith's contribution to moral philosophy and asks crucial questions about the interdependence between morality and religion. Colapietro offers quite an amazing synopsis of Smith's many utterances on the idea of living reason (contrasted with the logician's formal reason) and the necessity of recovering it in order to better understand the very nature of our concrete quest for intelligibility. Neville strives to reread Smith's theory of experience as an attempt to relocate metaphysics within experience, and he does this by considering two topics, being and God. Smith's substantial responses are for him an occasion to revisit his earlier writings and to clarify many of his ideas, which he

does with both breadth and depth. The book ends with a comprehensive bibliography of Smith's works.

Peirce, Signs, and Meaning

Floyd Merrell
University of Toronto Press, 1997, xvii + 384 pp.
ISBN 0-8020-4135-3 (cloth), \$65.00
ISBN 0-8020-7982-2 (paper), \$24.95

Merrell continues his travel across the semiotic universe with an account of his efforts to unravel the "scandal of meaning." His principal hypothesis is that "indeterminacy, at the heart of the vagueness and generality, the inconsistency and incompleteness, and the overdetermination and underdetermination of any and all signs, is the sliding fulcrum point of the life of signs and hence of their meaning." Merrell shows that Peirce's semiotics includes a real theory of meaning that does justice to the above hypothesis, one which leads to realizing that "meaning is not in the signs, the things, or the head, but in the processual rush of semiosis." The book contains a preamble (a dialogue between three characters) and fifteen chapters of great insight and suggestiveness that no Peirce-bred philosopher/semiotician can afford to overlook, given the rich evocations and intelligent applications and extensions of Peirce's theory, and also given the many contrasts provided with other contemporary and not so contemporary philosophers.

Jonathan Edwards's Writings: Text, Context, Interpretation

Stephen J. Stein (ed.)
Indiana University Press, 1996, 240 pp.
ISBN 0-253-33082-3 (cloth), \$49.95

This volume contains a collection of essays on the writings of Jonathan Edwards. The main purpose of the collection is to set Edwards's thought in context. Part I contains four studies of unpublished manuscripts, which discuss Edwards's sermon series on the parable of the wise and foolish virgin, his late messianic prophecies, his views on the regulation of religious discourse, and his attitude toward Islam. Part II contains a