

BOOK NOTES

In this section we publish short descriptive notices of new books about Peirce or subjects likely to interest our readers. We cannot survey all new publications or prepare critical reviews, so we notice only those books sent by authors and publishers. When available, we reprint notices supplied with the books (often edited and supplemented with text from prefaces or introductions); otherwise we prepare our own brief announcements. Please note: we notice books only if they are sent as review copies to be deposited in the Project library. Prices and ISBNs are given when available.

Synechism. Aspetti del pensiero di Charles Sanders Peirce

Gianmatteo Mameli
Università degli Studi di Bologna, Italy,
Tesi di Laurea in Semiotica, 1995–96,
vii + 300 pp.

In this dissertation, Mameli attempts to bring a Peircean answer to two major Kantian problems: (1) what is the nature of cognizability, intelligibility, and rationality and (2) how can we conciliate the many descriptions of the world provided by “hard scientists” with the common-sense view that sees the world as pervaded with aspects and properties that are full of meaning (the beautiful, the good, the just, the true). Mameli’s ambitious work divides into three parts. The first, based on Peirce’s classification of the sciences, provides a solid description of important parts of Peirce’s system, with a special focus on the relation between mathematics, semiotics, and metaphysics. The second part teems with presentations of formal models and technical concepts in order to reconstruct Peirce’s theory of the continuum and to show, among other things, how it differs from Cantorian theory. Mameli explores Peirce’s logic of relations and shows how it is connected to the continuum theory. The last part uses Peirce’s semiotic and metaphysical writings to build a synechistic theory about the knowability and the metaphysical structure of the world. Taken as a whole, Mameli’s dissertation offers to Italian readers a subtle and quite comprehensive account of Peirce’s philosophical system.

Charles S. Peirce: La lógica del descubrimiento

Gonzalo Génova
Servicio de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Navarra, Cuadernos de Anuario Filosófico, Serie Universitaria no. 45,
1997, 90 pp.

This little book, the product of a thesis for a “licencia” in philosophy, constitutes a

clear and comprehensive historical and theoretical introduction to Peirce’s logic of abduction and discovery. In the first part Génova discusses Peirce’s logic of inference, starting with the early anti-intuitionist texts and continuing with the 1877–78 texts on the logic of science. The reader is introduced to Peirce’s classification of arguments and to the three types of inference and their syllogistic analysis. The second part is devoted to the logic of inquiry, and discusses the roles of induction and abduction in scientific investigation. The book ends with some considerations on our guessing instinct and Peirce’s fallibilism. A short bibliography closes the work.

“Il segno matematico in C. S. Peirce.” (The Mathematical Sign in C. S. Peirce)

Susanna Marietti
Dissertation, University of Milan, 1999
(Forthcoming under the title *Icona e diagramma. Il segno matematico in C. S. Peirce*, Collana “Il Filarete,” LED,
2001)

Marietti’s dissertation begins with an analysis of Peirce’s notion of hypostatic abstraction and its role in his study of mathematical reasoning. The categorical deduction of Peirce’s 1867 *On a New List of Categories* is followed closely to show how this notion, although not yet explicitly formulated by Peirce, already plays a central role in his thought. Next, the notion of hypostatic abstraction—in its relation with philosophical realism—is set within the framework of mathematical reasoning. Within the same framework theorematic reasoning (which is related to hypostatic abstraction) is contrasted with corollarial reasoning. Marietti seeks to show how the distinction traced by Peirce between these two sorts of deductive reasoning provides a useful starting point to study the mathematical sign.

In chapter 2, the Peircean argument for the observational character of mathematics is considered. Mathematics is

interpreted as an informational and experimental science, and the mathematician’s work is compared with that of empirical scientists. The notion of diagram is introduced and is considered in its indexical, symbolical, and iconical aspects. A comparison with Kantian philosophy, which is a recurrent theme in the dissertation, shows how for Peirce the mathematical diagram fulfills a role similar to that of the schemes in Kant’s philosophy, albeit in a speculative context that avoids the phenomenon–noumenon dualism. Marietti concludes the chapter with an explanation of the relation between logic and mathematics and Peirce’s constructive attitude toward deduction.

In chapter 3, mathematical and philosophical themes dealt with in the previous chapters are brought within Peirce’s wider synechistic pragmatism, with explicit reference to inductive sciences, metaphysics, and cosmology. Further, the problem of fallibilism in mathematics is considered. The concluding fourth chapter surveys some modern interpretations of Peircean themes dealt with in the dissertation.

“Modes of Being: A Comparison of the Realism Question in Charles Peirce and Contemporary Analytic Philosophy”

Catherine Legg
Dissertation, Australian National University, 1999

Legg explores Peirce’s “modes of being,” or categories, with particular reference to how commitment to them structures his realism. Peirce’s realism, Legg argues, is not so much a commitment to particular, existent entities as a commitment to *a posteriori* precisification of meanings. In this it bears some semblance to a recent trend within analytic philosophy toward a meaning-externalism that rides on rigid designation, thereby giving birth to “*a posteriori* necessities”; though it differs insofar as Peirce understands such meaning-clarification as *precisification* rather than identification.

BOOK NOTES

Peirce's account of meaning, Legg continues, may be distinguished into an explication of the meaning a concept has *for us*, which consists of the *expectations* that hypotheses containing that concept would lead us to form; and the meaning it has *simpliciter*, which consists of the *development* the concept undergoes over time and across the community of inquiry, and which often goes beyond our expectations. Both dimensions of meaning are shown to depend on Peirce's concept of continuity. Interesting parallels are drawn between Peirce's discussion of thirdness and firstness and Wittgenstein's discussion of rule-following. The latter has been mistakenly interpreted by Kripke as a radical new form of *skepticism*. Peirce's communitarian explication of meaning, truth, and reality is distinguished from Kripke's "skeptical" solution to the rule-following problem, and from various 'neo-pragmatisms.'

Because of the three categories, Peirce's realism swims against the tide of analytic philosophy, where a commitment to a univocal concept of being, most notably by Quine, has been most influential. The latter approach, Legg argues, encourages a tendency to reification to solve philosophical problems. In contrast, Peirce's three categories enable a triadic, processual analysis of signification, which, unlike the more usual dyadic framework of word and object, builds the interpretation (and development) of signs into the representation itself, and thereby into realism.

Theories of the Sign in Classical Antiquity

Giovanni Manetti, trans. by Christine Richardson
Indiana University Press, 1993, xvi + 196 pp.
ISBN 0-253-33684-8 (cloth), \$35.00

This English translation of Manetti's 1987 book presents a fascinating work on the pre-classical and classical origins of semiotic theory, beginning with a study of Mesopotamian and Greek divination; continuing with an investigation into Plato, Aristotle, Stoic philosophy, Epicurus, Philodemus, Cornificius, Cicero, and Quintillian; and finishing with a subtle reading of Augustine. Manetti makes con-

siderable use of the semiotic triangle (a triple dyadic construction with attributes different from Peirce's semiotic triad) as a grid of structural analysis, and one may wish his approach had been more genuinely triadic to see whether this could have modified the nuances of some conclusions. But in any case the book is extremely informative and insightful about the history of semiotics, and brings to light the development of semiotic concepts, which in itself is tantamount to retracing the steps of our logical evolution.

Reason, Experience, and God: John E. Smith in Dialogue

Vincent M. Colapietro (ed.)
Fordham University Press, 1997, 158 pp.
ISBN 0-8232-1706-x (cloth), \$28.00
ISBN 0-8232-1707-8 (paper), \$18.00

As an homage to a great contemporary American philosopher, this book fulfills its role admirably, with four searching and questioning papers by four solid thinkers—the late Vincent Potter; Robert J. Roth, S.J.; Vincent Colapietro; and Robert Neville—and with four considerate responses by John Smith. Potter emphasizes Smith's attempt to "recover experience" in the sense of saving that concept from its recent reductionistic past, and questions him about the nature of "religious experience," the distinction between immediate and direct experience of God, and his criticisms of ontological and cosmological arguments for God. Roth captures much of the essence of Smith's contribution to moral philosophy and asks crucial questions about the interdependence between morality and religion. Colapietro offers quite an amazing synopsis of Smith's many utterances on the idea of living reason (contrasted with the logician's formal reason) and the necessity of recovering it in order to better understand the very nature of our concrete quest for intelligibility. Neville strives to reread Smith's theory of experience as an attempt to relocate metaphysics within experience, and he does this by considering two topics, being and God. Smith's substantial responses are for him an occasion to revisit his earlier writings and to clarify many of his ideas, which he

does with both breadth and depth. The book ends with a comprehensive bibliography of Smith's works.

Peirce, Signs, and Meaning

Floyd Merrell
University of Toronto Press, 1997, xvii + 384 pp.
ISBN 0-8020-4135-3 (cloth), \$65.00
ISBN 0-8020-7982-2 (paper), \$24.95

Merrell continues his travel across the semiotic universe with an account of his efforts to unravel the "scandal of meaning." His principal hypothesis is that "indeterminacy, at the heart of the vagueness and generality, the inconsistency and incompleteness, and the overdetermination and underdetermination of any and all signs, is the sliding fulcrum point of the life of signs and hence of their meaning." Merrell shows that Peirce's semiotics includes a real theory of meaning that does justice to the above hypothesis, one which leads to realizing that "meaning is not in the signs, the things, or the head, but in the processual rush of semiosis." The book contains a preamble (a dialogue between three characters) and fifteen chapters of great insight and suggestiveness that no Peirce-bred philosopher/semiotician can afford to overlook, given the rich evocations and intelligent applications and extensions of Peirce's theory, and also given the many contrasts provided with other contemporary and not so contemporary philosophers.

Jonathan Edwards's Writings: Text, Context, Interpretation

Stephen J. Stein (ed.)
Indiana University Press, 1996, 240 pp.
ISBN 0-253-33082-3 (cloth), \$49.95

This volume contains a collection of essays on the writings of Jonathan Edwards. The main purpose of the collection is to set Edwards's thought in context. Part I contains four studies of unpublished manuscripts, which discuss Edwards's sermon series on the parable of the wise and foolish virgin, his late messianic prophecies, his views on the regulation of religious discourse, and his attitude toward Islam. Part II contains a

BOOK NOTES

number of essays on the relationship between Edwards's writings and those of other major religious and philosophical figures, including Solomon Stoddard, Thomas Shepard, George Berkeley, and William James. Part III concentrates on the nineteenth-century reception of Edwards at Yale, at Oberlin College, among evangelical women during the Second Great Awakening, and by Edwards A. Park, the great popularizer of the New England Theology.

American Ethics: A Source Book from Edwards to Dewey

G.W. Stroh and H.G. Callaway (eds.)
University Press of America, 2000, 520 pp.
ISBN 0-7618-1826-X (paper), \$42.00

American Ethics contains a large selection of original texts, running from Roger Williams (1603?–83) to William Frankena (1908–94), that is well suited for university courses in ethics, including introductory courses. The texts are generally short, often under ten pages, and each text is preceded by a short introduction. The book is divided into six sections: (1) Puritanism, Liberty of Conscience, and the Religious Background; (2) Enlightenment and Natural Rights; (3) Transcendentalism and Human Dignity; (4) Pragmatism, Evolution, and Humanism; (5) Idealism, Evil, and Prejudice; (6) Naturalism, Science, and Society. Each section opens with a short introduction and closes with discussion questions and suggestions for further reading. Not surprisingly, *American Ethics* contains little Peirce; it includes segments of “What Pragmatism Is” and “Evolutionary Love,” making up 13 of the circa 500 pages.

Zeichen deuten auf Gott: Der zeichentheoretische Beitrag von Charles S. Peirce zur Theologie der Sakramente

Martin Vetter
N.G. Elwert, 1999, xiv + 305 pp.
ISBN 3-7708-1119-4

Within the theology of the sacraments there is a long-standing tradition to interpret the sacraments as signs (e.g., Martin Luther and Huldreich Zwingli). The aim

of Vetter's study is to continue in that tradition by reinterpreting the twentieth-century German theology of the sacraments in terms of Peirce's semeiotic. Vetter concentrates his study largely upon the views of Karl Barth, Paul Tillich, and Wolfhart Pannenberg, but draws attention also to the views of Wilfried Härle and Hermann Deuser. The application of Peirce's semeiotic to the theology of the sacraments follows an in-depth exposition of Peirce's semeiotic and its position within Peirce's thought.

The Economic Mind in America: Essays in the History of American Economics

Malcolm Rutherford (ed.)
Routledge, 1998, 352 pp.
ISBN 0-415-13355-6 (cloth), \$90.00

This anthology explores the variety of American economics and gives American economics a place of its own, as distinct from its European roots. The volume contains seventeen papers, one of which is devoted exclusively to Peirce. This paper, written by James Wible, concentrates on Peirce's economic reasoning in his 1901 methodological essay “On the Logic of Drawing History from Ancient Documents, Especially from Testimonies” (EP2, sel. 8). Part IV, “Institutional Economics,” is devoted entirely to Thorstein Veblen, once a student of Peirce. The last paper in this section, written by Philippe Broda, compares Veblen with the pragmatist economist John R. Commons, who in chapter 4 of his 1934 *Institutional Economics* discussed Peirce's pragmatism, comparing it to the views of Hume.

Radical Pragmatism: An Alternative

Robert J. Roth, S.J.
Fordham University Press, 1998, xviii + 168 pp.
ISBN 0-8232-1851-1 (cloth), \$35.00
ISBN 0-8232-1852-X (paper), \$18.00

Can pragmatism and classical religion be reconciled? Following the lead of William James in his *Radical Empiricism*, Roth argues that contemporary pragmatists can further radicalize the notion of experience to accommodate classical spir-

itual and religious perspectives on knowledge, morality, God, religion, and personhood. Roth discusses the pragmatic views of Peirce, James, and Dewey, and appeals to the thought of Pierre Teilhard de Chardin to build his bridge between pragmatism and religion. Peirceans will find especially interesting Roth's Emersonian reading of Peirce's “Neglected Argument.”

Ariel y Arisbe. Evolución y Evaluación del Concepto de América Latina en el Siglo XX: Una Visión Crítica desde la Lógica Contemporánea y la Arquitectónica Pragmática de C. S. Peirce

Fernando Zalamea
Convenio Andrés Bello, Edición 2000, 200 pp.

An airy good spirit in Shakespeare's *The Tempest*, Ariel is also the title of an 1899 manifest by Uruguayan writer J. E. Rodó (1871–1917), where it symbolizes the creative vitality of Latin America as opposed to the monstrous Calibán represented by the United States. Zalamea shows how the prodigious work Peirce produced at Arisbe allows Calibán to redeem himself by providing analytical and interpretational tools that enable us to better understand the destinal place Latin America occupied in the twentieth century, notably through the grand universalist tradition fostered by such thinkers as Reyes, Vasconcelos, Estrada, Paz, and Ribeiro. Zalamea's main hypothesis is that Latin America is a relational place within a continuum, and that its general capacity for hybridization and counterpoints constantly swings it to and fro between the two poles of universality and resistance. Chapter 1 presents the universalist tradition and emphasizes how the search for unity and identity can be detected in the Latin American cultural manifold. Chapter 2 presents Zalamea's instruments of analysis: first, the study of universals and relations from the standpoint of contemporary mathematical logic; and second, the pragmatistic system of Peirce, with the three categories, a modelization of the pragmatic maxim, a discussion of his semiotic, his classification of the sciences, the concepts of generality, vagueness, determinacy, and

BOOK NOTES

indeterminacy. Chapter 3 applies many of these Peircean concepts to identifying universalist tendencies present in a number of Latin American artistic and literary works. The last chapter shows how Peirce's philosophy is indispensable to understanding the contemporary world, and attacks postmodernism's pretension to have gotten rid of the illusions of universalization. Zalamea shows how such a claim harbors a logical fallacy, and opposes to it Peirce's "Einsteinian turn," that of having made it possible for universals to exist without absolutes.

The Peirce Seminar Papers: Essays in Semiotic Analysis, Vol. 3

Michael Shapiro (ed.)
Peter Lang, 1998, 123 pp.
ISBN 0-8204-3142-7 (hardback), \$39.95

This is the Jakobson Centenary Volume in Shapiro's rich and illuminating series devoted to semiotics from a Peircean standpoint. Volume 3 includes papers by Shapiro, Edna Andrews, Paul Friedrich, Carol Hult, Roberta Kevelson, and T. L. Short. (Peirce is dealt with by Shapiro, Kevelson, and Short.) Shapiro opens the book by pointing out that among the debts linguists owe to Jakobson is the championing of Peirce as "a genuine and bold forerunner of structural linguistics." But Shapiro goes on to show that Jakobson

tended to treat Peirce as a historical figure, a forerunner, and not as a continuing source of fresh insight and untapped potential. Jakobson glimpsed Peirce's importance but never fully understood Peirce's semiotic enterprise. Short elaborates on this assessment in his contribution, "Jakobson's Problematic Appropriation of Peirce." Short's critique of Jakobson not only sharpens the differences in the views of these two important thinkers, but, in doing so, Short illuminates Peirce's semiotics from the standpoint of linguistics and, rather unexpectedly, illuminates Peirce's teleology. Peirceans will find Short's piece worth the price of the volume.

Reading Peirce Reading

Richard A. Smyth
Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.,
1997, ix + 327 pp.
ISBN 0-8476-8432-6 (cloth), \$89.00
ISBN 0-8476-8433-4 (paper), \$28.95

In this interesting book, Smyth examines several of Peirce's most important early writings from the standpoint of what they reveal about Peirce's own reading of the history of philosophy. Smyth probes the first two articles of Peirce's 1868 *Journal of Speculative Philosophy* series and then the opening articles of Peirce's 1878 *Popular Science Monthly* series for what they

reveal about Peirce's reading of Mill, Kant, and Descartes, among others. His findings are illuminating. Smyth's work helps locate Peirce's philosophy within the evolution of modern thought but, more broadly, it sheds helpful light on the origins of pragmatism.

On Peirce

Cornelis de Waal
Wadsworth, 2001, 91 pp.
ISBN 0-534-58376-8 (paper), \$14.95

If you have ever thought it would be helpful to have a compact treatment of Peirce that covers all the main points without the usual exciting but distracting sideshows, De Waal's *On Peirce* is the book you had in mind. It is organized after Peirce's own classification of the sciences and is divided into short, manageable sections that present concise but excellent summaries of Peirce's rich ideas. De Waal's aim is modest: "to make accessible the key elements of Peirce's thought and to bring them in relation to one another." He has succeeded admirably and has given us a very readable book that will surprise even longtime Peirce scholars with the clarity it brings to Peirce's full system of thought and with how well it positions readers to relate Peirce's ideas to contemporary issues. This book is perfect for the classroom.

ANOTHER PEIRCE BOOK LOCATED: BOWEN'S *TREATISE ON LOGIC*

Nathan Houser, PEP director, and Albert Lewis, associate editor, recently visited *Collected Papers* editor Paul Weiss at his home in Washington, D.C. As Lewis was examining the centenarian philosopher's extensive personal library, he discovered an old logic book, Francis Bowen's *Treatise on Logic, or the Laws of Pure Thought, Comprising Both the Aristotelic and Hamiltonian Analyses of Logical Forms, and Some Chapters of Applied Logic* (Cambridge: Sever and Francis, 1864). Francis Bowen (1811–90) is no longer well-known today, but in his day, as Alford Professor of Natural Religion, Moral Philosophy, and Civil Polity (1853–89), he was for several decades Harvard's principal philosophy professor. As such, he was one of Peirce's important

teachers, for whom the 20-year-old Charles seems to have nurtured a mixture of respect and contempt. In *The Rise of American Philosophy* (Yale University Press, 1977), p. 28, Bruce Kuklick tells us that as a historian of modern philosophy Bowen has had no superior at Harvard; that his writing was penetrating, deft, and witty; that he was a shrewd and able defender of the philosophic underpinnings of Unitarianism; that he left his mark on Chauncey Wright, Charles Peirce, and William James; and that the principal reason why Bowen fell into oblivion can be traced back to his rejection of Darwinism.

The first appearance of Bowen in Peirce's writings is found in an amusing marginal remark Peirce scribbled in his

tenth senior composition, an essay assigned by Bowen and titled "Analysis of Genius," due 19 March 1859 (W1: 25–30). In the course of the essay Peirce started using the word "faculty" in a special sense, and in order to remind his reader, Bowen, of this special sense throughout, he decided to "write the word in blue ink through the remainder of the forensic, to avoid introducing a general abuse of the term." At this point, no doubt well after he received the essay back, Peirce added an asterisk, to which the following marginal remark corresponded: "the fun of this consisted in the fact that Bowen was color blind." In another remark added to working notes for this composition Peirce wrote that De Morgan called Bowen an "obscure metaphysical

Continued at top of page 11